

ACI 309.2R-15

# Guide to Identification and Control of Visible Surface Effects of Consolidation on Formed Concrete Surfaces

Reported by ACI Committee 309



American Concrete Institute  
*Always advancing*



## **Guide to Identification and Control of Visible Surface Effects of Consolidation on Formed Concrete Surfaces**

Copyright by the American Concrete Institute, Farmington Hills, MI. All rights reserved. This material may not be reproduced or copied, in whole or part, in any printed, mechanical, electronic, film, or other distribution and storage media, without the written consent of ACI.

The technical committees responsible for ACI committee reports and standards strive to avoid ambiguities, omissions, and errors in these documents. In spite of these efforts, the users of ACI documents occasionally find information or requirements that may be subject to more than one interpretation or may be incomplete or incorrect. Users who have suggestions for the improvement of ACI documents are requested to contact ACI via the errata website at <http://concrete.org/Publications/DocumentErrata.aspx>. Proper use of this document includes periodically checking for errata for the most up-to-date revisions.

ACI committee documents are intended for the use of individuals who are competent to evaluate the significance and limitations of its content and recommendations and who will accept responsibility for the application of the material it contains. Individuals who use this publication in any way assume all risk and accept total responsibility for the application and use of this information.

All information in this publication is provided “as is” without warranty of any kind, either express or implied, including but not limited to, the implied warranties of merchantability, fitness for a particular purpose or non-infringement.

ACI and its members disclaim liability for damages of any kind, including any special, indirect, incidental, or consequential damages, including without limitation, lost revenues or lost profits, which may result from the use of this publication.

It is the responsibility of the user of this document to establish health and safety practices appropriate to the specific circumstances involved with its use. ACI does not make any representations with regard to health and safety issues and the use of this document. The user must determine the applicability of all regulatory limitations before applying the document and must comply with all applicable laws and regulations, including but not limited to, United States Occupational Safety and Health Administration (OSHA) health and safety standards.

Participation by governmental representatives in the work of the American Concrete Institute and in the development of Institute standards does not constitute governmental endorsement of ACI or the standards that it develops.

Order information: ACI documents are available in print, by download, on CD-ROM, through electronic subscription, or reprint and may be obtained by contacting ACI.

Most ACI standards and committee reports are gathered together in the annually revised ACI Manual of Concrete Practice (MCP).

**American Concrete Institute**  
**38800 Country Club Drive**  
**Farmington Hills, MI 48331**  
**Phone: +1.248.848.3700**  
**Fax: +1.248.848.3701**

# Guide to Identification and Control of Visible Surface Effects of Consolidation on Formed Concrete Surfaces

Reported by ACI Committee 309

Patrick F. O'Brien Jr., Chair

Timothy P. Dolen  
Chiara F. Ferraris  
John F. Gibbons\*  
Glenn A. Heimbruch

Vincent E. Hunt\*  
Gary R. Mass  
Richard E. Miller  
Larry D. Olson

H. Celik Ozyildirim  
Steven A. Ragan  
Bradley K. Violetta

*Consulting Members*  
Jerome H. Ford  
Donald L. Schlegel  
\*Revision Committee members.

*This document provides guidelines for identifying and controlling visible effects on the surface of concrete as it relates to consolidation on precast or cast-in-place-formed concrete surfaces. A perfectly homogenous and blemish-free concrete element is difficult, if not impossible, to achieve. This document, therefore, does not define an acceptable level of quality, as this should be defined in the contract documents.*

*This guide explores the direct and indirect cause-and-effect relationships, as well as other factors, concerning concrete surface appearance. Photographs are included in this document to illustrate typical concrete surface finish effects that are a departure from absolute perfection. Negative surface effects in concrete can be minimized by proper planning during the design and specification stages. Significant consolidation factors that minimize undesirable concrete negative surface effects are also discussed.*

**Keywords:** bugholes; consistency; consolidation; construction joints; discoloration; form offset; formwork (construction); layer lines; mixture proportioning; plastic settlement cracking; preplaced-aggregate concrete; quality control; sand streaking; surface air voids; surface defects; vibration; workability.

ACI Committee Reports, Guides, and Commentaries are intended for guidance in planning, designing, executing, and inspecting construction. This document is intended for the use of individuals who are competent to evaluate the significance and limitations of its content and recommendations and who will accept responsibility for the application of the material it contains. The American Concrete Institute disclaims any and all responsibility for the stated principles. The Institute shall not be liable for any loss or damage arising therefrom.

Reference to this document shall not be made in contract documents. If items found in this document are desired by the Architect/Engineer to be a part of the contract documents, they shall be restated in mandatory language for incorporation by the Architect/Engineer.

## CONTENTS

### CHAPTER 1—INTRODUCTION AND SCOPE, p. 2

- 1.1—Introduction, p. 2
- 1.2—Scope, p. 2

### CHAPTER 2—DEFINITIONS, p. 2

- 2.1—Definitions, p. 2

### CHAPTER 3—FACTORS CAUSING NEGATIVE SURFACE EFFECTS, p. 2

- 3.1—General causes of negative surface effects, p. 2
- 3.2—Design considerations of structural members, p. 2
- 3.3—Specifications, p. 4
- 3.4—Forms, p. 4
- 3.5—Properties of fresh concrete, p. 6
- 3.6—Placement, p. 7
- 3.7—Consolidation, p. 7
- 3.8—Special construction conditions, p. 7

### CHAPTER 4—NEGATIVE SURFACE EFFECTS, p. 8

- 4.1—Honeycomb, p. 8
- 4.2—Air voids in formed surfaces, p. 8
- 4.3—Formstreaking, p. 8
- 4.4—Aggregate transparency, p. 8
- 4.5—Color variation, p. 8
- 4.6—Sand streaking, p. 9
- 4.7—Layer lines, p. 9

ACI 309.2R-15 supersedes ACI 309.2R-98 and was adopted and published February 2015.

Copyright © 2015, American Concrete Institute.

All rights reserved including rights of reproduction and use in any form or by any means, including the making of copies by any photo process, or by electronic or mechanical device, printed, written, or oral, or recording for sound or visual reproduction or for use in any knowledge or retrieval system or device, unless permission in writing is obtained from the copyright proprietors.

4.8—Form offsets, p. 9

4.9—Plastic settlement cracking, p. 9

## CHAPTER 5—MINIMIZING NEGATIVE SURFACE EFFECTS, p. 9

## CHAPTER 6—CONCLUSION, p. 10

## CHAPTER 7—REFERENCES, p. 10

Cited references, p. 10

### CHAPTER 1—INTRODUCTION AND SCOPE

#### 1.1—Introduction

This guide is a reference source for specifiers, design engineers, architects, contractors, and other professionals who work with concrete surface finish of formed surfaces. The ability to identify or categorize negative surface effects is the first step in detecting the root cause of them. The goal of this guide is to differentiate between various negative surface effects to improve the concrete process and subsequent concrete quality. The cause of negative concrete surface effects is sometimes not correctly diagnosed. For example, air voids are usually attributed to lack of vibration in circumstances where the correct source of the imperfection is ill-prepared formwork or improper selection of the form-release agent. With misdiagnosis, negative surface effects are likely to occur again because appropriate corrective actions have not been identified and taken.

This guide includes a summary of direct and indirect causes of negative surface effects in concrete surface finishes, along with photographs to illustrate them. The most serious effects resulting from ineffective consolidation procedures are also reviewed. They include honeycomb, cold joints, and excessive surface voids. A detailed description of these occurrences and their causes are provided. Of equal importance is the employment of properly trained and motivated supervisory and nonsupervisory construction personnel to achieve the intended concrete finishes and surface textures. Extreme negative surface effects do not always conform to the acceptable limits required by contract documents and might be considered defective work. Methods for minimizing surface effects are also discussed.

#### 1.2—Scope

This guide does not define an acceptable level of quality, as this should be determined by the parties involved with the project. A perfectly formed concrete surface, uniformly smooth or deeply textured and essentially free of negative surface effects and color variation, is impossible to attain. Repairs to concrete surfaces are costly and difficult. The best repair work will not be as good as an original properly finished surface. Every effort should be made before and during construction to minimize repairs by establishing and maintaining quality concrete operations and adhering to acceptable consolidation procedures for producing formed concrete work. Concrete construction procedures and project costs do not always provide the conditions necessary

to consistently obtain perfectly homogenous concrete free of all negative surface effects. Several negative surface effects discussed in this guide are tolerable and inherent in concrete production. Other potential causes of such negative surface effects may exist beyond those listed in this report. It is the responsibility of the specifier to indicate in the contract documents what constitutes acceptable and unacceptable negative surface effects for the various surfaces to be produced under the terms of a given contract. Surface tolerance specifications can be found in **ACI 347.3R-13**, Table 3.1.

To achieve any concrete finish, the designer and contractor should use the most appropriate materials and design and construction practices to minimize negative surface effects and keep them within acceptable limits. This guide should not be used as a standard for surface finishes, but rather as a guide for the identification of surface effects and their causes. Because concrete consolidation is considered an established field, current research is limited.

### CHAPTER 2—DEFINITIONS

#### 2.1—Definitions

ACI provides a comprehensive list of definitions through an online resource, “ACI Concrete Terminology,” <http://www.concrete.org/tools/concreteterminology.aspx>.

**radius of influence**—plan-view-area that a vibrator is able to produce sufficient impulses to consolidate concrete.

### CHAPTER 3—FACTORS CAUSING NEGATIVE SURFACE EFFECTS

#### 3.1—General causes of negative surface effects

Table 3.1 presents the primary causes of surface conditions that factor into the resulting negative surface effects for the following factors: member design, formwork, construction conditions, concrete properties, placement, and consolidation. Examples of common negative surface effects are illustrated in Fig. 3.1a through 3.1i. The causes of negative surface effects on formed concrete surfaces are described in Table 3.1.

#### 3.2—Design considerations of structural members

Common problems requiring consideration during design and planning are congested reinforcement—in particular, splices, narrow sections, or complex form configurations. Conditions that require closed top forming, embedments, and battered forms also require consideration during design and planning. Figure 3.2 features a dense matrix of pipe inserts and illustrates the importance of having a consolidation plan well in advance of production.

To produce properly consolidated concrete with the desired appearance, placement and consolidation of concrete should be understood. The designer should have working knowledge of the concrete placement process. The designer and constructor should communicate during early phases of the concreting process. Early recognition of problem areas will allow enough time to take remedial measures, such as staggering splices, grouping reinforcing steel, modifying stirrup